



Interim Underground Stabilization Activities at the Giant Mine, Yellowknife NT

Fairness Monitor Final Report

Date of Report:

August 29, 2014

Submitted To:

Director General

Operational Integrity Sector

Departmental Oversight Branch

Submitted by:

PPI Consulting Limited

Table of Contents

1.	BACKGROUND.....	1
2.	PROJECT REQUIREMENT	2
3.	ATTESTATION OF ASSURANCE.....	3
4.	METHODOLOGY.....	4
5.	REFERENCES.....	7

1. Background

PPI Consulting Limited was engaged as a Fairness Monitor (FM) to observe all stages of the procurement process for the Interim Underground Stabilization Activities at the Giant Mine in Yellowknife, Northwest Territories issued by Public Works and Government Services Canada (PWGSC) as a result of Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F. PPI Consulting Limited is an independent third party with respect to this activity.

In accordance with the terms of our engagement, we familiarized ourselves with the relevant solicitation documents, observed the issuance of four Requests for Information (RFIs) and related activities; observed the development and issuance of the Request for Proposal (RFP); and observed the evaluation of proposals and pre-contract award activities.

We hereby submit the Final Report, covering the activities of the Fairness Monitor, commencing with the first RFI to advise industry of an optional site visit prior to the release of the RFP and continuing through to the preparation of the award of the contract.

We will continue with the observation of the contract award and post-award activities and document the results of these observations in an addendum to the Final Report.

2. Project Requirement

Giant Mine was a large-scale gold mine that operated from 1945 to 2004 under a series of different owners. The most recent owners of the mine were assigned to bankruptcy in 2005 and responsibility for this site has since been assigned to Aboriginal Affairs and Northern Development Canada (AANDC). Also since 2005, the required Care and Maintenance at the Giant Mine Site, including environmental management activities, have been contracted out by AANDC and PWGSC. The underground mine has been maintained by the Giant Mine Care and Maintenance Contractor, who is the designated Mine Manager at the site.

The monitored procurement is one of over 20 separate procurement processes under the Giant Mine Remediation Project. The Remediation Plan calls for the long-term storage and management of 237,000 tonnes of arsenic trioxide dust stored in sealed chambers and stopes (irregular, mined-out cavities) cut into solid rock. The Remediation Plan also outlines activities to demolish more than 100 buildings and facilities on the surface of the Giant Mine site. The arsenic trioxide dust was created during the production of more than seven million ounces of gold between 1948 and 1999. When the ore was roasted to release the gold, arsenic was also released as a gas, which became arsenic trioxide dust as it cooled.

A risk assessment of the underground mine workings indicated a higher risk of crown pillar failure in some of the underground chambers and stopes. The purpose of the monitored procurement is to mitigate these risks by backfilling portions of the underground mine.

The Fairness Monitor Specialist was originally assigned on October 29, 2012 for the Giant Mine Project under a previous RFP process (Solicitation No. EW702-131876/A). This solicitation was published on April 5, 2013 and closed on May 22, 2013. An evaluation of the proposals submitted in response to this solicitation took place and subsequently, a decision was made by PWGSC on June 19, 2013 to cancel the RFP process because all bids were non-responsive or did not represent fair value.

A revised RFP was developed and released through the Government Electronic Tendering Service (<https://Buyandsell.gc.ca>) on April 24, 2014 under Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F. Bidders were kept informed of the process through four Letters of Interest (LOIs) published on Buyandsell (Solicitation Nos. EW702-131876/B, /C, /D and /E), which included an optional site visit prior to the publication of the revised RFP.

3. Attestation of Assurance

The Fairness Monitor hereby provides the following unqualified assurance statement concerning the procurement of design/build services for the Giant Mine Interim Underground Stabilization Activities (Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F). It is our professional opinion that the procurement processes that we observed, was carried out in a fair, open and transparent manner.

John Davis, President
PPI Consulting Limited

Ian Brennan, CSCMP
FM Team Leader

Lorne Schmidt, PEng, PMP
Fairness Monitor Specialist

4. Methodology

PPI Consulting Limited was engaged as a Fairness Monitor to observe the procurement process for the Giant Mine Interim Underground Stabilization Activities, and to attest to the fairness, openness and transparency of this monitored activity. In accordance with the terms of our engagement, we familiarized ourselves with the relevant documents, observed the pre-bid solicitation processes, the bid solicitation activities, and the evaluation of the proposals; identified fairness-related matters to the PWGSC Contracting Authority; and ensured that responses and actions were reasonable and appropriate.

The following is a synopsis of the process, communications and activities that have been conducted with respect to the fairness monitoring of the Giant Mine Interim Underground Stabilization Activities up to and including the end of the proposal evaluation process.

1. Giant Mine Project Document Review:

- 1.1. An LOI was published on Buyandsell (Solicitation No. EW702-131876/B) on September 20, 2013 and closed on October 3, 2013 to announce that PWGSC would be conducting an Optional Site Visit and Information Session on October 9 and 10, 2013 for potential Bidders who would be interested in submitting a proposal for the Interim Underground Stabilization contract at the Giant Mine site. The intent of the site visit was to provide potential Bidders the opportunity to see the site prior to winter conditions as it was anticipated that the requirement would be re-competed during the winter of 2013-2014.
- 1.2. An LOI was published on Buyandsell (Solicitation No. EW702-131876/C) on October 24, 2013 and closed on November 29, 2013 to provide a summary of the Optional Site Visit that was held on October 9, 2013 and the Information Session that was held on October 10, 2013 and to provide written answers to 13 questions that were posed by potential Bidders during the Site Visit and Information Session.
- 1.3. An LOI was published on Buyandsell (Solicitation No. EW702-131876/D) on January 28, 2014 and closed on February 11, 2014 to provide a draft of the anticipated team requirements to be evaluated as part of the upcoming RFP and to provide the updated schedule estimates for the procurement milestones (RFP release, Mandatory Site Visits, Solicitation Closing and Contract Award).
- 1.4. An LOI was published on Buyandsell (Solicitation No. EW702-131876/E) on February 25, 2014 and closed on March 5, 2014 to announce the anticipated dates of the Mandatory Site Visit (March 11 and 12, 2014), the Mandatory Bidders Conference (March 13, 2014) and the Optional Site Visit (beginning of April 2014) and the conditions related thereto. Interested bidders were required to register with the Contracting Authority to confirm their attendance at the Mandatory Site Visit and Bidders Conference.

- 1.5. On March 3, 2014, registered Bidders were informed by e-mail by PWGSC that the release of the RFP had been delayed and that more information on the RFP would be available on Buyandsell in the near future.
- 1.6. The RFP was published on Buyandsell (Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F) on April 24, 2014 and closed on June 30, 2014.
- 1.7. A total of 13 amendments to the RFP were published on Buyandsell between May 3, 2014 and June 26, 2014. Collectively, written answers were provided through the amendments to 108 questions that were posed during the Site Visits, the Bidders Conference and submitted in writing by e-mail to the Contracting Authority. An additional 33 reference documents were released through the amendments.
- 1.8. An LOI titled "Giant Mine Procurement Outlook" was published on Buyandsell on May 9, 2014 (Solicitation No. EW702-140115/F) and closed on June 30, 2014. The Giant Mine Procurement Outlook specifies the conflict of interest scenarios for approximately 20 different procurement activities at the Giant Mine site, including the Interim Underground Stabilization Activities and served as a reference in answers to some of the questions published for the RFP process being monitored.
- 1.9. The Fairness Monitor Specialist was provided with copies of all draft RFP documents. The Fairness Monitor Specialist completed a review of these documents and provided feedback. All feedback was satisfactorily addressed in subsequent revisions of the RFP documents.
- 1.10. The PWGSC Contracting Authority provided copies of all pertinent e-mail messages concerning the Giant Mine RFP process to the Fairness Monitor Specialist for review. The Fairness Monitor Specialist acknowledged receipt of these e-mail messages and provided feedback when required.
- 1.11. The Fairness Monitor Specialist was consistently provided with copies of all proposed RFP documents (updates, amendments) prior to their release, as well as proposed wording for answers to questions and other planned communications to Bidders. The Fairness Monitor Specialist completed a review of each of these documents and planned communications, and provided feedback to the PWGSC Contracting Authority. The PWGSC Contracting Authority made modifications to documents and issued communications to Bidders which satisfactorily addressed all of the Fairness Monitor Specialist observations.
- 1.12. Six proposals were received at the designated PWGSC Bid Receiving location prior to the solicitation closing date and time on June 30, 2014 at 14:00 CST.

2. Giant Mine Project Site Visit, Information Session and Bidders Conference Observations:

- 2.1. An Optional Site Visit was held on October 9, 2013 at the Giant Mine site in Yellowknife, prior to the release of the RFP.
- 2.2. An Optional Bidders Information Session was held on October 10, 2013 at the Giant Mine site in Yellowknife, prior to the release of the RFP.
- 2.3. A Mandatory Site Visit was held on May 12 and May 13, 2014 at the Giant Mine site in Yellowknife as part of the RFP process.
- 2.4. A Mandatory Bidders Conference was held on May 14, 2014 at the United Church in Yellowknife as part of the RFP process.
- 2.5. An Optional Site Visit was held on June 3, 2014 at the Giant Mine site in Yellowknife as part of the RFP process.
- 2.6. The Fairness Monitor Specialist observed all Site Visits, the Information Session and the Bidders Conference. There were no fairness issues or potential fairness deficiencies identified with respect to these procurement activities.

3. Evaluation of Proposals:

- 3.1. The Kickoff Meeting for the Evaluation Board was held on July 2, 2014 by teleconference, during which the Contracting Authority reviewed the distributed evaluation procedures. This meeting was observed by the Fairness Monitor Specialist.
- 3.2. The Evaluation Consensus Meetings were held on July 14-17, 2014 in Winnipeg, Manitoba and were observed by the Fairness Monitor Specialist.
- 3.3. The technical evaluation was conducted in accordance with the process defined in the RFP. No fairness-related issues were observed.
- 3.4. The assessment of the Aboriginal Opportunities Consideration (AOC) evaluation criteria was conducted in accordance with the process defined in the RFP. No fairness-related issues were observed.
- 3.5. The financial assessment was conducted in accordance with the process defined in the RFP. No fairness-related issues were observed.
- 3.6. The determination of the Best Value assessment was conducted in accordance with the process defined in the RFP. No fairness-related issues were observed.
- 3.7. The final ranking of proposals was completed in accordance with the process defined in the RFP. No fairness-related issues were observed.

5. References

1. The following types of references are listed in the tables on the following pages:
 - 1.1. Buyandsell website pages;
 - 1.2. Documents provided in PDF format posted on the Buyandsell website; and
 - 1.3. Evaluation reference documents and report.

Buyandsell Web Site References for Prior Cancelled Solicitation EW702-131876/A ¹						
Ref. #	Website Reference	Publication Date	Closing Date	Notice Type	Notice Title	Language
1	https://buyandsell.gc.ca/procurement-data/tender-notice/PW-GMP-004-6073	2013/04/05	2013/05/22	Notice of Proposed Procurement	Interim Underground Stabilization Activities, Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT (EW702-131876/A)	English

Buyandsell Web Site References for Solicitations Under the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities						
Ref. #	Website Reference	Publication Date	Closing Date	Notice Type	Notice Title	Language
2	https://buyandsell.gc.ca/procurement-data/tender-notice/PW-GMP-004-6124	2013/09/20	2013/10/03	Letter of Interest / Advance Notice to Industry	Interim Underground Stabilization Optional Site Visit - Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT (EW702-131876/B)	English
3	https://buyandsell.gc.ca/procurement-data/tender-notice/PW-GMP-004-6145	2013/10/24	2013/11/29	Letter of Interest	Interim Underground Stabilization Optional Site Visit Summary - Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT (EW702-131876/C)	English

¹ Originally published on MERX, but available to Bidders on Buyandsell through a "Related Tender Notices" link. The Buyandsell web page for the cancelled solicitation includes the related RFP document and seven published amendments in both English and French versions, which are not included in the list of references in this report. Readers of this report can access the prior cancelled solicitation documents from the referenced web site, but these documents are not references within the scope of the fairness monitoring activities for this report. The links to the cancelled solicitation are provided as references for this report since they were provided on all the web site pages of the solicitation notices that were monitored.

Buyandsell Web Site References for Solicitations Under the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities						
Ref. #	Website Reference	Publication Date	Closing Date	Notice Type	Notice Title	Language
4	https://buyandsell.gc.ca/procurement-data/tender-notice/PW-GMP-004-6193	2014/01/28	2014/02/11	Letter of Interest	Interim Underground Stabilization Activities, Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT (EW702-131876/D)	English
5	https://buyandsell.gc.ca/procurement-data/tender-notice/PW-GMP-004-6209	2014/02/25	2014/03/05	Letter of Interest	Interim Underground Stabilization Activities - Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT (EW702-131876/E)	English
6	https://buyandsell.gc.ca/procurement-data/tender-notice/PW-GMP-004-6229	2014/04/24	2014/06/30	Notice of Proposed Procurement	Interim Underground Stabilization Activities, Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT (EW702-131876/F)	English

Buyandsell Web Site References for Referenced Solicitation EW702-140115/F ²						
Ref. #	Website Reference	Publication Date	Closing Date	Notice Type	Notice Title	Language
7	https://buyandsell.gc.ca/procurement-data/tender-notice/PW-GMP-006-6232	2014/05/09	2014/06/30	Letter of Interest	Giant Mine Procurement Outlook (EW702-140115/F)	English

² Referenced from Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F Amendment 002 in response to a question on conflicts of interest.

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/C ³				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
8	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6145.EBSU000.PDF	Letter of Interest Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/C (2013-10-23) Interim Underground Stabilization Contract Pre-Tender Site Visit and Information Session October 9th and 10th, 2013 Meeting Summary	4	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Originally Published RFP Document and Attachments				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
9	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU000.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F (2014-04-23)	133	English
10	terms_of_reference_en.pdf	Terms of Reference Project No. R.014204.300 Giant Mine Interim Underground Stabilization (undated)	107	English
Terms of Reference – Appendix A Files				
11	appendix_a_-_overview_information_for_advanced_remediation_stabilization_activities_golder_2014.pdf ⁴	Overview Information for Advanced Remediation Stabilization Activities (February 12, 2014)	902	English

³ There were no published documents for Solicitations Nos. EW702-131876/B, EW702-131876/D and EW702-131876/E. These solicitations were only published as notices on the Buyandsell website that were identified as Letters of Interest.

⁴ Ref. #11 is a compilation of Ref. #s 12 to 42 within a large (114MB) single PDF file. Ref. #s 12 to 42 were duplicates of elements of Ref. #20 and were released as separate files of smaller, more manageable sized PDF files.

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Originally Published RFP Document and Attachments				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
12	appendix_1_-_b1-18_comprehensive_mitigation_plan.pdf	1-18 Mid Complex Void(s) Backfilling Underground Implementation Plan, Working Implementation Plan (Rev. 8, Nov 19, 2013)	34	English
13	appendix_1_-_b1-18_lessons_learned.pdf	2013 B1-18 Stope Complex Backfill Project - Lessons Learned, January 28, 2014	6	English
14	appendix_2_-_stope_description_spreadsheet.pdf	Appendix 2: Giant Mine: Interim Underground Stabilisation ⁵ Activities - Void Volume, Underground Access, Stope Backfill Requirements (February 12, 2014)	1	English
15	appendix_3_-_drillhole_design_criteria.pdf	Criteria for Drillhole Design (January 29, 2014)	2	English
16	appendix_4_-_paste_test_report_dec_2013.pdf	Paste Field Trial Alternate Binders (January 31, 2014)	47	English
17	appendix_4_-_paste_test_report_oct_2013.pdf	Paste Field Trial and Flow Loop Testing (January 31, 2014)	46	English
18	appendix_5_-_letter_in_response_to_resin_test.pdf	Performance of Foaming Resin During Field Proof-of-Concept Trial (January 30, 2014)	2	English
19	appendix_5_-_resin_test_report.pdf	Foaming Resin Proof-of-Concept Test Report (January 30, 2014)	14	English

⁵ Typographical error in published document.

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Originally Published RFP Document and Attachments				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
20	appendix_6_-_field_investigate.pdf	Summary of Field Investigation Programs on the North/South/Central Ponds at Giant Mine (January 24, 2014)	20	English
21	appendix_6_-_lab_report_south_pond.pdf	Giant Mine Backfill Testing - South Pond (January 28, 2014)	95	English
22	appendix_6_-_october_test_pit.pdf	Field Investigation for Paste Production Planning at Giant Mine – October 2013 (January 24, 2014)	59	English
23	appendix_6_-_sc_pond.pdf	Giant Mine Backfill Testing - South and Central Pond (January 29, 2014)	155	English
24	appendix_6_-_sc_pond_investigate.pdf	Field Investigation for Tailings Excavation Planning at Giant Mine – July 2013 (January 27, 2014)	7	English
25	appendix_6_-_south_pond_photos.pdf	Photographs – Giant Mine South Pond, 2013 (January 28, 2014)	4	English
26	appendix_6_-_tailings_2011.pdf	Phase 1 - Tailings Investigation Giant Mine Remediation Project (January 18, 2011)	45	English
27	appendix_6_-_tailings_2012.pdf	Tailings Investigation, Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NWT (June 29, 2012)	222	English
28	appendix_7_-_land_use_document.pdf	Issuance of Type A Land Use Permit Drilling & Soils Testing, Giant Mine Site, NT (September 13, 2012)	16	English
29	appendix_8_-_water_license.pdf	Issuance of Type B Water Licence Roaster Deconstruction and Underground Stabilization Work Giant Mine, NT (March 28, 2013)	24	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Originally Published RFP Document and Attachments				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
30	appendix_9_-_accessible_roads.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project , Giant Mine Overview (Rev. A, 14/01/31)	1	English
31	appendix_10_-_tailings_pond_drainage.pdf	Surface Drainage Patterns – South, Central, North Ponds (January 27, 2014)	2	English
32	appendix_11_-_b1-18_onsite_paste_testing.pdf	Giant Mine On-Site Backfill Testing (January 31, 2014)	52	English
33	appendix_11_-_b1-18_paste_backfill.pdf	Paste Backfill Geochemistry (January 31, 2014)	4	English
34	appendix_12_-_flowsheet.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Paste Production Area Process Flow Diagram (undated)	1	English
35	appendix_12_-_l-001.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Paste Trial Area South Tailings Pond General Arrangement As Constructed (Rev. 0 13-12-05)	1	English
36	appendix_12_-_m-001.pdf ⁶	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Paste Trial Area Flowloop General Arrangement As Constructed (Rev. 0 13-12-03)	1	English
37	appendix_12_-_sea_can_.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Paste Field Trial Sea Can Modifications (Rev. A 13-10-03)	1	English

⁶ Ref #36 was actually released with Amendment 001, but was also included within Ref. #11 and is therefore included in this reference list in its logical sequence with related references.

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Originally Published RFP Document and Attachments				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
38	appendix_12_-_ug_piping_drawing.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Underground Paste Pipeline 1-18 Upper Stope General Arrangement As Constructed (Rev. 0 14-01-23)	1	English
39	appendix_12_-b1_pit.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Underground Paste Production Area B1 Pit General Arrangement As Constructed (Rev. 0 13-12-03)	1	English
40	appendix_12_-m-004.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Tailing Heated Storage Dome Alternative Binder Field Trial General Arrangement As Constructed (Rev. 0 14-01-17)	1	English
41	appendix_13_-_underground_stabilization_emp.pdf	Environmental Management Plan for the Giant Mine Interim Underground Stabilization Activities (February 13, 2014)	24	English
42	appendix_1_-_b1-18_comprehensive_mitigation_plan.pdf	1-18 Mid Complex Void(s) Backfilling Underground Implementation Plan, Working Implementation Plan (Rev. 8, Nov 19, 2013)	34	English
Terms of Reference – Appendix A, "Conceptual Mitigation Plans" Files				
43	1_-_conceptual_mitigaiton_plan_b1-18_stope.pdf	B1-18 Stope Void Backfilling Completion Plan (Rev. 1, Feb 7, 2014)	9	English
44	2_-_conceptual_mitigaiton_plan_b3-06_stope_complex.pdf	B3-06 Stope Void Backfilling Conceptual Mitigation Plan (Rev. 1, Feb 7, 2014)	11	English
45	3_-_conceptual_mitigaiton_plan_a3-70_stope.pdf	A3-70 Stope Void Backfilling Conceptual Mitigation Plan (Rev. 1, Feb 7, 2014)	7	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Originally Published RFP Document and Attachments				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
46	4_-_conceptual_mitigaiton_plan_b3-10_midstope_complex.pdf	B3-10 Mid Complex Void(s) Backfilling Conceptual Mitigation Plan (Rev. 1, Feb 7, 2014)	9	English
Terms of Reference – Appendix A, "Two Dimensional Drawing Packages" Files⁷				
47	1_-_overall_giant_mine_site.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Key Plan and List of Drawings, Drawing Package 1 of 7 Overall Site (Rev. 1 2014-02-12)	2	English
48	2_-_consultant_access_maps.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Key Plan and List of Drawings, Drawing Package 2 of 7 Overall B1 & B3 Pit Areas (Rev. 1 2014-02-12)	6	English
49	3_-_b1-18_stope_complex.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Key Plan and List of Drawings, Drawing Package 3 of 7 B1-18 Area (Rev. 1 2014-02-12)	54	English
50	4_-_b3-06_stope_complex.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Key Plan and List of Drawings, Drawing Package 4 of 7 B3-06 Area (Rev. 1 2014-02-12)	74	English
51	5_-_a3-70_stope_complex.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Key Plan and List of Drawings, Drawing Package 7 of 7 A3-70 Area (Rev. 1 2014-02-12)	60	English

⁷ Although each drawing package was labeled "Package ___ of 7", there were only 6 drawing packages published. A correct list of the drawing packages was provided in the table of contents of the covering document Terms of Reference – Appendix A. There were no inquiries about the incorrectly labeled drawing packages.

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Originally Published RFP Document and Attachments				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
52	6_-_b3-10_mid_stope_complex.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Key Plan and List of Drawings, Drawing Package 6 of 7 B3-10 Mid (Rev. 1 2014-02-12)	77	English
Terms of Reference – Appendix B Files				
53	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.ATTA002.PDF	Table 1: PWGSC AOC Monthly Labour Summary (undated template form)	3	English
Terms of Reference – "List of Drawings" Files⁸				
54	c00_-_cover_sheet.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project, Interim Underground Stabilization Activities Issued for Tender (Cover Sheet) (12. Feb. 2014)	1	English
55	c01_-_giant_mine_site_overview.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project , Giant Mine Overview (Rev. B, 14/02/12)	1	English
56	c02_-_tailings_ponds.pdf	Giant Mine Remediation Project , Tailings Ponds (Rev. B, 14/02/12)	1	English
Terms of Reference – "List of Supporting Documents" Files				
57	859 Computer Aided Design (CAD) and supporting files provided on a CD in 142 Folders ⁹	Three Dimensional Mine Model – Geo-Con, Golder 2014		English

⁸ These drawings were listed separately from the drawing packages.

⁹ Provided on a CD only to registered Bidders at the Bidders Conference on May 14, 2014 in Yellowknife, NT. Collectively referred to as a single reference for the solicitation.

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 001				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
58	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU001.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 001 (2014-05-02)	4	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 002				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
59	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU002.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 002 (2014-05-08)	6	English
60	arsenic_stope_backfilling.pdf	General Description of Work - Arsenic Stope Backfilling - FY 2014/2015 Backfill Tender Addendum, Giant Mine, NT (May 2, 2014) ¹⁰	6	English
61	1-ventilation-title_page_.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, cover sheet (undated)	1	English
62	2-ventilation-level_100_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 1 (updated March 2014)	1	English
63	3-ventilation-level_250_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 2 (updated March 2014)	1	English

¹⁰ This document provided a description of additional work to be performed under an option to the contract. The option was subsequently removed in Amendment 012.

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 002				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
64	4-ventilation-level_250_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 3 (updated March 2014)	1	English
65	5-ventilation-level_425_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 4 (updated March 2014)	1	English
66	6-ventilation-level_250_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 5 (updated March 2014)	1	English
67	7-ventilation-level_425_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 6 (updated March 2014)	1	English
68	8-ventilation-level_425_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 7 (updated March 2014)	1	English
69	9-ventilation-level_575_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 8 (updated March 2014)	1	English
70	10-ventilation-level_575_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 9 (updated March 2014)	1	English
71	11-ventilation-level_750_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 10 (updated March 2014)	1	English
72	12-ventilation-level_750_abc.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 11 (updated March 2014)	1	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 002				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
73	13-ventilation-level_750_abc.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 12 (updated March 2014)	1	English
74	14-ventilation-level_750_abc.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 13 (updated March 2014)	1	English
75	15-ventilation-level_750_abc.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 14 (updated March 2014)	1	English
76	16-ventilation-general_aka.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 15 (updated March 2014)	1	English
77	17-ventilation-level_100_aka.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 16 (updated March 2014)	1	English
78	18-ventilation-level_250_aka.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 17 (updated March 2014)	1	English
79	19-ventilation-level_575_aka.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 18 (updated March 2014)	1	English
80	20-ventilation-level_425_aka.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 19 (updated March 2014)	1	English
81	21-ventilation-level_575_aka.pdf <i>(in response to Q&A #3)</i>	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 20 (updated March 2014)	1	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 002				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
82	22-ventilation-level_750_aka.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #3</i>)	Ventilation and Mine Rescue Routes for Giant Mine 2014, Page 21 (updated March 2014)	1	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 003				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
83	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU003.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 003 (2014-05-21)	3	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 004				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
84	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU004.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 004 (2014-06-04)	9	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 005				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
85	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU005.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 005 (2014-06-06)	12	English
86	underground_services_b3-06.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #4</i>)	B3-06 Stope Void Backfilling Conceptual Mitigation Plan (Rev. 1, Feb 7, 2014)	11	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 005				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
87	underground_services_b3-10.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #4</i>)	B3-10 Mid Complex Void(s) Backfilling Conceptual Mitigation Plan (Rev. 1, Feb 7, 2014)	9	English
88	ius_drilling_summary.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #6</i>)	Untitled document [Interum Underground Stabilization Drilling Summary] (May 27, 2014)	1	English
89	geophysical_survey.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #7</i>)	Geophysical Investigation: Giant Mine Tailings, Yellowknife, NWT (May 26, 2014)	24	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 006				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
90	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU006.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 006 (2014-06-06)	18	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 007				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
91	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU007.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 007 (2014-06-10)	5	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 008				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
92	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU008.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 008 (2014-06-12)	5	English
93	b3-10_mid_lidar_and_photos.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #7</i>)	B3-10Mid Stope Complex Mandatory Blockages and Fill Volume Containment Points – 2nd Level (5JUN14)	6	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 009				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
94	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU009.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 009 (2014-06-13)	5	English
95	golder_mss_doc113.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #4</i>)	Production Report on Giant Mine B1-18 Stope Complex (February 26, 2014)	52	English
96	golder_mss_doc120.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #5</i>)	Void Backfilling Work Summary Giant Mine B1-18 Stope Complex (March 31, 2014)	121	English
97	2_bridge_drawings.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #6</i>)	Deton'Cho / Nuna, Baker Creek Reach 4, 21.336 Meter Timber Deck Bridge (Rev. 2 Aug. 18. 06)	9	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 010				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
98	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU010.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 010 (2014-06-17)	4	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 011				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
99	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU011.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 011 (2014-06-19)	16	English
100	terms_of_reference_medical_monitoring.pdf (<i>in response to Q&A #1 and Q&A #4</i>)	Special Project Procedures for Contaminated Sites – Medical Monitoring (undated)	4	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 012				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
101	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU012.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 012 (2014-06-23)	3	English

Solicitation Documents for the Current Scope of Fairness Monitoring Activities				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F – Amendment 013				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
102	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B004.E6229.EBSU013.PDF	Request for Proposal Interim Underground Stab Activities, Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F, Amendment 013 (2014-06-24)	2	English

Solicitation Documents for the Referenced Solicitation No. EW702-140115/F				
Documents for Solicitation No. EW702-140115/F				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
103	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B006.E6232.EBSU000.PDF	Letter of Interest Giant Mine Assessment - Giant Mine Procurement Outlook (Version 4)	26	English
104	ABES.PROD.PW_GMP.B006.E6232.EBSU001.PDF	Letter of Interest Giant Mine Assessment - Giant Mine Procurement Outlook (Version 4) <i>same as Ref. # 125 - republished</i>	26	English

Evaluation Documents				
Ref. #	Filename	Document Title	Pages	Language
105	Evaluation Summary.pdf	Solicitation No.: EW702-131876/F - Interim Underground Stabilization Activities Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT Evaluation Criteria Table and Submission Requirements	8	English
106	A Guide to the Evaluation Board.pdf	Evaluation Board Procedures A Guide to the Evaluation Board, July 2013	5	English
107	Rating Scale.pdf	Rating Scales and Categories	1	English
108	Confidentiality Declaration.pdf	Confidentiality/Conflict of Interest Declaration for RFP Evaluation Board (Voting and Non Voting) Members PWGSC Solicitation No.: EW702-131876/F	1	English
109	Individual Evaluation Form.pdf Individual Evaluation Form.docx	Technical Evaluation and Rating Individual Evaluation Form – Solicitation No.: EW702-131876/F - Interim Underground Stabilization Activities - Giant Mine, Yellowknife, NT	7	English
110	Conflict of Interest Consultant – XX.pdf	Conflict of Interest Declaration for Consultant	1	English
111	Interim Underground evaluations_Comments (Updated 30 Jul 14).xls	Technical Evaluation and Rating - Consensus Evaluation Solicitation No.: EW702-131876/F - Interim Underground Stabilization Activities - Giant Mine, Yellowknife	6 worksheets	English

ADDENDUM TO THE FAIRNESS MONITOR FINAL REPORT

September 26, 2014

Addendum to Fairness Monitor Final Report dated August 29, 2014 on the procurement process for the Interim Underground Stabilization Activities at the Giant Mine in Yellowknife, Northwest Territories by Public Works and Government Services Canada (PWGSC). This Addendum to the Fairness Monitor Final Report covers the period following the conclusion of the evaluation phase and addresses specifically the process for debriefing unsuccessful bidders and the review of the contract.

There were six bids submitted in response to the Request for Proposal (RFP) issued under Solicitation No. EW702-131876/F. Four bids did not meet all mandatory requirements for the technical evaluation and consequently were declared to be non-responsive. These bids were disqualified and Canada did not proceed any further with their evaluation. Two bids met all mandatory requirements for the technical evaluation and subsequently underwent the financial evaluation and best value determination. An award letter was issued to the successful Bidder on August 8, 2014. The unsuccessful bidders were advised of the results on August 11, 2014 in a letter in which they were informed of the name the successful bidder, the total assessed best value score of the successful bidder, and the price of the awarded contract.

Unsuccessful Bidders were invited to contact the Contracting Authority if they required further information regarding the evaluation of their proposal. Two of the disqualified bidders requested debriefings, which were provided on August 22, 2014 and September 24, 2014. The purpose of the debriefings was to explain to the unsuccessful bidders why their bid were not accepted, thereby allowing them to improve for future proposals; and to demonstrate the fairness, openness, and transparency of the federal government contracting process. These results were clearly achieved and no fairness issues were identified.

The Fairness Monitor reviewed the Giant Mine Interim Underground Stabilization Activities draft contract, final contract (Contract No. EW702-131876/001/GMP dated August 8, 2014) and contract award notice (published on the Buyandsell web site on September 5, 2014) with respect to the associated Request for Proposal. PWGSC reported that there were no discussions or negotiations conducted between Canada and the successful bidder. The bidder's proposal was accepted and the contract issued accordingly. Administrative changes from the RFP were implemented for the issuance of the contract (e.g. addition of points of contact, submission of Certificate of Insurance, Contract Security, etc.).

The Fairness Monitor hereby provides the following unqualified assurance statement:

It is our professional opinion that the competitive procurement process for the Interim Underground Stabilization Activities at the Giant Mine in Yellowknife, Northwest Territories that we observed, was carried out in a fair, open and transparent manner.

John Davis, President
PPI Consulting Limited

Ian Brennan, CSCMP
FM Team Leader

Lorne Schmidt, PEng, PMP
FM Specialist